

Appendix 2 (as submitted by author): AMSTAR Quality Assessment of Meta-analysis or Systematic Reviews of Vitamin D¹

AMSTAR item *	1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8	9	10	11
Author, Yr (question addressed)	A priori design	Duplicate study selection/ extraction	Lit search in >1 database	Grey lit	List of studies provided	Characteristics of included studies	Quality assessed/ documented	Quality in formulating conclusion	Methods to combine appropriate	Publication bias	Conflict of interest
Autier ¹³ , 2007 (vitamin D supplements and mortality)	Y	N	CA	Y	Y	Y	N	N	Y	Y	Y
Avenell ² , 2005 (vitamin D and analogues and fracture)	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	N	Y
Bischoff-Ferrari ¹¹ , 2004 (vitamin D and falls)	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
Bischoff-Ferrari ³ , 2005 (vitamin D and fracture)	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
Boonen ⁴ , 2007 (calcium with vitamin D and hip fracture)	Y	Y	Y	CA	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
Gorham ¹⁵ , 2007 (vitamin D and colorectal cancer)	Y	Y	N	N	Y	Y	N	N	Y	N	Y
Gaugris ¹⁴ , 2005 (prevalence of vitamin D inadequacy)	Y	N	N	N	N	Y	N	N	NA	N	Y
Izaks ⁵ , 2007 (vitamin D and fracture)	Y	N	N	N	N	N	Y	N	N	Y	Y
Jackson ⁶ , 2007 (vitamin D and falls, fracture)	Y	N	N	N	N	Y	Y	N	Y	N	Y
Latham ¹² , 2003 (vitamin D and falls, strength)	Y	N	Y	Y	N	Y	Y	Y	N	N	Y

Appendix to Hanley DA, Cranney A, Jones G, et al.; for the Guidelines Committee of the Scientific Advisory Council of Osteoporosis Canada. Vitamin D in adult health and disease: a review and guideline statement from Osteoporosis Canada. *CMAJ* 2010. DOI:10.1503/cmaj.080663.

Nnoham ¹⁷ , 2008 (serum 25-OH-D and tuberculosis risk)	Y	N	N	Y	Y	Y	Y	N	Y	Y	Y
Papadimitropoulos ⁸ , 2002 (vitamin D and analogues and osteoporosis)	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	N	N
Pittas ¹⁶ , 2007 (vitamin D and Type 2 Diabetes)	Y	N	N	Y	N	Y	N	N	Y	N	Y
Richy ¹⁰ , 2008 (vitamin D compared to calcitriol or alfacalcidol and falls)	Y	N	N	N	Y	Y	N	N	Y	Y	N
Richy ⁷ , 2005 (vitamin D compared to calcitriol or alfacalcidol and fractures)	Y	Y	N	N	N	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	N
Tang ⁹ , 2007 (Calcium +/- vitamin D and fractures)	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y

Y= yes, N= no, NA= not applicable, CA Can't answer

* Explanation of AMSTAR items:

1. The research question and inclusion criteria should be established before the conduct of the review.
2. There should be at least two independent data extractors and a consensus procedure for disagreements should be in place.
3. The authors should state that they searched for reports regardless of their publication type.
4. The authors should state whether or not they excluded any reports (from the systematic review), based on their publication status, language etc.
5. A list of included and excluded studies should be provided.
6. In an aggregated form such as a table, data from the original studies should be provided on the participants, interventions and outcomes.
7. 'A priori' methods of assessment should be provided.
8. The results of the methodological rigor and scientific quality should be considered in the analysis and the conclusions of the review, and explicitly stated in formulating recommendations.
9. For the pooled results, a test should be done to ensure the studies were combinable, to assess their homogeneity.
10. An assessment of publication bias should include a combination of graphical aids (e.g., funnel plot, other available tests) and/or statistical tests (e.g., Egger regression test).
11. Potential sources of support should be clearly acknowledged in both the systematic review and the included studies.

References

1. Shea BJ, Grimshaw JM, Wells GA, Boers M, Andersson N, Hamel C et al. Development of AMSTAR: a measurement tool to assess the methodological quality of systematic reviews. *BMC Med Res Methodol* 2007;7:10.
2. Avenell A, Gillespie WJ, Gillespie LD, O'Connell DL. Vitamin D and vitamin D analogues for preventing fractures associated with involutional and post-menopausal osteoporosis. *Cochrane Database Syst Rev* 2005;CD000227.
3. Bischoff-Ferrari HA, Willett WC, Wong JB, Giovannucci E, Dietrich T, Dawson-Hughes B. Fracture prevention with vitamin D supplementation: a meta-analysis of randomized controlled trials. *JAMA* 2005;293:2257-2264.
4. Boonen S, Lips P, Bouillon R, Bischoff-Ferrari HA, Vanderschueren D, Haentjens P. Need for additional calcium to reduce the risk of hip fracture with vitamin d supplementation: evidence from a comparative metaanalysis of randomized controlled trials. *J Clin Endocrinol Metab* 2007;92:1415-1423.
5. Izaks GJ. Fracture prevention with vitamin D supplementation: considering the inconsistent results. *BMC Musculoskelet Disord* 2007;8:26.
6. Jackson C, Gaugris S, Sen SS, Hosking D. The effect of cholecalciferol (vitamin D3) on the risk of fall and fracture: a meta-analysis. *QJM* 2007;100:185-192.
7. Richy F, Schacht E, Bruyere O, Ethgen O, Gourlay M, Reginster JY. Vitamin D analogs versus native vitamin D in preventing bone loss and osteoporosis-related fractures: a comparative meta-analysis. *Calcif Tissue Int* 2005;76:176-186.
8. Papadimitropoulos E, Wells G, Shea B, Gillespie W, Weaver B, Zytaruk N et al. Meta-analyses of therapies for postmenopausal osteoporosis. VIII: Meta-analysis of the efficacy of vitamin D treatment in preventing osteoporosis in postmenopausal women. *Endocr Rev* 2002;23:560-569.
9. Tang BM, Eslick GD, Nowson C, Smith C, Bensoussan A. Use of calcium or calcium in combination with vitamin D supplementation to prevent fractures and bone loss in people aged 50 years and older: a meta-analysis. *Lancet* 2007;370:657-666.
10. Richy F, Dukas L, Schacht E. Differential effects of D-hormone analogs and native vitamin D on the risk of falls: a comparative meta-analysis. *Calcif Tissue Int* 2008;82:102-107.
11. Bischoff-Ferrari HA, Dawson-Hughes B, Willett WC, Staehelin HB, Bazemore MG, Zee RY et al. Effect of Vitamin D on falls: a meta-analysis. *JAMA* 2004;291:1999-2006.

12. Latham NK, Anderson CS, Reid IR. Effects of vitamin D supplementation on strength, physical performance, and falls in older persons: a systematic review. *J Am Geriatr Soc* 2003;51:1219-1226.
13. Autier P and Gandini S. Vitamin D supplementation and total mortality: a meta-analysis of randomized controlled trials. *Arch Intern Med* 2007;167:1730-1737.
14. Gaugris S, Heaney RP, Boonen S, Kurth H, Bentkover JD, Sen SS. Vitamin D inadequacy among post-menopausal women: a systematic review. *QJM* 2005;98:667-676.
15. Gorham ED, Garland CF, Garland FC, Grant WB, Mohr SB, Lipkin M et al. Optimal vitamin D status for colorectal cancer prevention: a quantitative meta analysis. *Am J Prev Med* 2007;32:210-216.
16. Pittas AG, Lau J, Hu FB, Dawson-Hughes B. The role of vitamin d and calcium in type 2 diabetes. A systematic review and meta-analysis. *J Clin Endocrinol Metab* 2007;92:2017-2029.
17. Nnoaham KE and Clarke A. Low serum vitamin D levels and tuberculosis: a systematic review and meta-analysis. *Int J Epidemiol* 2008;37:113-119.